



CAO Hiring Committee Agenda

Date: Friday, March 8, 2024
Time: 10:00 am
Location: Electronic Zoom Meeting

	Pages
1. CALL TO ORDER	
2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA	
3. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING	
3.1 February 20, 2024 DRAFT Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee Meeting Minutes	2 - 4
For review and adoption	
4. FUAL	
No follow-up action list to present.	
5. BUSINESS	
5.1 Executive Search Firm - Business Case	5 - 9
6. NEXT MEETING	
The next meeting of the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee will be conducted electronically on Friday, March 22, 2024, from 10:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m.	
7. CLOSED MEETING	
CAOHC-2024-xxx	
It was MOVED and SECONDED,	
that the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee meeting be closed to the public under s,90(1)(a) and (c) of the Community Charter for discussion regarding personal information about an identifiable individual who holds or is being considered for a position as an officer, employee or agent of the Islands Trust or another position appointed by the Islands Trust, and labour relations or other employee relations, and that the Director, Legislative Services and the Executive Coordinator be invited to attend.	
8. RISE AND REPORT	
9. ADJOURNMENT	



CAO Hiring Committee Minutes of a Regular Meeting

Date: February 20, 2024
Location: Electronic meeting
And a public venue to watch the livestream:
Islands Trust
200-1627 Fort Street
Victoria, BC V8R 1H8

Members Present: Peter Luckham, Chair, Thetis Trustee
Tobi Elliott, Vice-Chair, Gabriola Trustee
David Maude, Vice-Chair, Mayne Trustee
Timothy Peterson, Vice-Chair, Lasqueti Trustee
Kristina Evans, Chair, Trust Programs Committee
Judi Gedye, Chair, Governance Committee, joined the meeting at 10:09 a.m.
Laura Patrick, Chair, Regional Planning Committee
Joe Bernardo, Chair, Financial Planning Committee

Staff Present: David Marlor, Director, Legislative Services (DLS)
Alexandra Trifonidis, Acting Executive Coordinator

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Luckham called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. and gave a territorial acknowledgement.

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

By general consent the agenda was approved as presented.

3. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

3.1 January 26, 2024 CAOHC draft meeting minutes

By general consent the meeting minutes of January 26, 2024 were approved as presented.

3.2 February 8, 2024 CAOHC draft meeting minutes

By general consent the meeting minutes of February 8, 2024 were approved as presented.

4. FUAL

No follow-up action list to present.

5. BUSINESS

5.1 Meeting Schedule

The following are proposed dates for the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee meetings until March 31, 2024:

1. Friday, March 8, 2024 (10 am – 1 pm or 1 pm – 4pm)
2. Friday, March 22, 2024 (9 am – 12 pm or 1 pm – 4 pm)

CAOHC-2024-006

It was MOVED and SECONDED,

that the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee adopt Friday, March 8, 2024 (10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.) as the next meeting date, and that the following meeting be held on Friday, March 22, 2024 (9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.).

CARRIED

6. NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee will be held electronically on Friday, March 8, 2024 from 10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.

7. CLOSED MEETING

CAOHC-2024-007

It was MOVED and SECONDED,

that the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee meeting be closed to the public under s.90(1)(a) and (c) of the Community Charter for discussion regarding personal information about an identifiable individual who holds or is being considered for a position as an officer, employee or agent of the Islands Trust or another position appointed by the Islands Trust, and labour relations or other employee relations, and that the Director, Legislative Services and the Acting Executive Coordinator be invited to attend.

CARRIED

The meeting was closed to the public at 9:17 a.m. and reopened at 11:47 a.m.

8. RISE AND REPORT

Chair Luckham reported out of the in-camera portion of the meeting on the following:

1. That the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee approves the release of the amended RFP to the Public Service Agency once completed.
2. That the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee request staff to prepare a business case for hiring a consultant to assist in the recruitment of a CAO for March Trust Council.
3. That the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee request CAO Hotsenpiller to provide a short list of currently available and suitable external acting CAOs and to consult with the CAO of BIM to obtain their comments regarding suitable potential CAO interim appointments.

Chair Luckham shared that the committee has been working well together.

9. ADJOURNMENT

By general consent the meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Peter Luckham, Chair

Certified Correct:

Alexandra Trifonidis, Acting Executive Coordinator/Recorder



Islands Trust

**Budget Funding Request
Short-Form Business Case**

Completion of this form initiates a request to the management team, FPC, and ultimately Trust Council for allocation funding in the next fiscal year budget. The form is to be completed and submitted at the start of the decision making process. The business case forms part of the Annual Budget Process (refer to Islands Trust Council Budget Process Policy 6.3.i).

TO BE COMPLETED BY INITIATOR

Requested by (*Committee or Operational Unit*):

Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee (CAOHC)

Department:

Executive (Trust Council)

Name of Request:

Executive Search for CAO

\$ Value of Request (*indicate by fiscal year and total if project is multi-year*):

\$75,000

Budget Source (select all that apply):

- ☐ **Specific Project Funding** (select all that apply)
- ☒ Third Party Contractors
 - ☐ Staff Travel Expense
 - ☐ Staff Overtime Expense
 - ☐ New Staff Member – Temporary for project
 - ☐ Computer Hardware/Software

☐ **Furniture & Equipment**

☐ **Computer Hardware/Software/Supplies**

☐ **New Staff Resources** (see Staff Costing Tool)

☐ **Permanent**

☐ **Temporary**

Temp Duration: _____

☐ **Other – please describe:** _____

Date of Submission to Finance:

Funding Required for (date range):

TIE TO ISLANDS TRUST GUIDING DOCUMENTS: (*Indicate how the proposed project/activity/work ties to Trust Council's strategic plan, Policy Statement directives, Council Bylaws, work programs, the Trust's object, etc. Provide a copy/paste of the relevant reference, along with hyperlinks to external documents where available.*)

[Trust Council Policy 2.4.1 Executive Committee Terms of Reference](#)

Trust Council [Policy 2.4.1](#) indicates that when the Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) retires that a committee made up of the Executive Committee and the chairs of Trust Council's standing committees be responsible for guiding the process for hiring a new CAO in consultation with Trust Council. This committee is called the Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee (CAOHC). Trust Council is the body that makes the final decision on who becomes its next CAO.

ISSUE/OPPORTUNITY: (*What issue are you trying to resolve with this initiative, or what opportunity has been identified that would benefit Islands Trust by undertaking this initiative? What are the future needs? What organizational objectives are being addressed? Include background information that decision makers will need to properly assess this request.*)

The incumbent CAO has indicated a retirement date of July 2024.

The CAOHC has decided that the best approach to hiring a new CAO is to engage with an executive search firm to assist Trust Council in reviewing the job description, developing a hiring strategy, searching for a CAO, developing and conducting interviews, making an offer and assisting with assessment during probationary period.

The Financial Planning Committee has included \$75,000 for this in the draft recommended budget for Fiscal Year 2024/25.

The CAOHC has issued a Request for Proposal (RFP), subject to funding approval, for an Executive Search Firm.

PROJECTED RESULTS/DELIVERABLES: *(How does this address the issue/opportunity described above? Indicate how results of this work will impact decision-making by trustees or staff. Will this work result in better decisions, more efficient decision-making, more efficient completion of work, better public perception, etc. Consider all possible results from undertaking this work.)*

The deliverables of the RFP are listed as follows:

10.1. Hiring Process, Responsibilities and Requirements of the CAO, and Selection Criteria

- 10.1.1. Working with the CAOHC to develop a process and timeline to successfully fill the position;
- 10.1.2. Assist and provide recommendations to the CAOHC to update the Job Profile to clearly define the duties and responsibilities, together with the results the CAO is expected to deliver. This task includes:
 - 10.1.2.1. Developing and implementing a confidential process to consult with Trust Council, the incumbent CAO, and senior staff (e.g., surveys or one-on-one discussions)
 - 10.1.2.2. Providing recommendations to the CAOHC to update the Job Profile; and
 - 10.1.2.3. Identifying and prioritizing CAO selection criteria.
- 10.1.3. Deliverables for this step include:
 - 10.1.3.1. A hiring process and timeline.
 - 10.1.3.2. A record of input gathered.
 - 10.1.3.3. An updated job profile.
 - 10.1.3.4. A prioritized selection criteria.

10.2. Recruiting for the CAO

- 10.2.1. Target potential candidates, develop and implement advertising to search for suitable candidates within and outside of the public service in British Columbia and Canada;

10.3. Screening and Selection

- 10.3.1. Working with the CAOHC to develop a selection process that is based on best practices for hiring of public sector executives, merit based and includes interviewing and skill testing strategies;
- 10.3.2. Assisting the CAOHC in evaluating and assessing the merit of the candidates in accordance with policies and procedures of the BC Public Service Agency and requirements of the BC Merits Commissioner
- 10.3.3. Participating with the CAOHC on the interview panel; and
- 10.3.4. Assisting the CAOHC in selecting and presenting an offer of employment.
- 10.3.5. Deliverables for this step include:
 - 10.3.5.1. A selection process.
 - 10.3.5.2. Documentation of the selection process and all candidate assessments performed under it.

10.4. Probationary Review Phase

- 10.4.1. Working with the CAOHC to develop a probationary review program that is based on best practices, and clarity on expectations on the results the CAO is expected to deliver within the first six months of employment.

10.5. Other

- 10.5.1. Working with the CAOHC to hire and select an interim CAO, if necessary.
- 10.5.2. A review of the current policy relating to interim appointment of the CAO position ([Trust Council Policy 8.4.1](#)).
- 10.5.3. Review and provide recommendations on strengthening Trust Council's policies on CAO Hiring and performance management to meet best practices ([Trust Council Policy 2.4.1](#)).

RISK ASSESSMENT: *(List and discuss potential risk factors associated with this work, if identified. List and discuss the options that exist to mitigate identified risks.)*

There is a risk that the process may not meet provincial public service requirements. The RFP requires that recruiting follow the *Public Service Act* and meet the requirements of the merit commissioner. The PSA has advised that it will work with the CAOHC at all steps along the way in hiring the new CAO.

There is a risk that the cost of hiring a firm is more than anticipated. The \$75,000 is based on past experiences in hiring a CAO, advice from the Public Service Agency, and the expected current going rate for an executive search firm, generally between 25% and 35% of the hiring salary for a CAO.

There is a risk that a CAO search firm would not meet the timeline to have a new CAO in place before the departure of the incumbent CAO. The CAOHC has considered this and is working on a process to hire an interim CAO to bridge the gap.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED: *(What other options/alternative courses of action were considered? List and discuss each alternative separately. Each option must be supported by a succinct and realistic presentation of the benefits, risks, financial implications, resource requirements and other implications to allow for an informed decision among the options. One option should reflect the status quo - i.e. do nothing - and the anticipated results of that action.)*

Option 1: CAOHC undertakes Hiring (in-house with Public Service Agency)

Benefits: Work would be undertaken using Islands Trust Staff and Public Service Agency (PSA) staff. This would result in not requiring funding to hire a consultant.

Risks:

Staff resources within Islands Trust and PSA are limited. PSA staff indicated while they can advise and review, they do not have resources to undertake writing, or sit on panels during interviewing process. This is a significant change from the last time that the Islands Trust hired a CAO. This could result in delays in recruitment process. Further the CAOHC has indicated that is also would like to, as part of the work in hiring a CAO, review the job description, develop a process for engaging Trust Council and senior staff, and develop performance metrics, in addition to undertaking a search for a CAO and conducting an interview process. The RFP optionally includes review and recommendation of Trust Council policy. This work could be done in-house, but with limited resources, could be delayed.

A further risk is the search for a CAO may be narrower if undertaken in-house with PSA support than it would with an executive search firm. The PSA is used to hiring for Provincial executive positions, and these are different to local government CAO positions. Given that the work of the Islands Trust and local trust committees is actually closer to that of local governments than provincial ministries, a search for CAOs with experience in regional districts and smaller rural and island communities would be much more beneficial to the Islands Trust.

Financial Implications: None – other than usual advertising and recruitments costs

Resource Requirements: At least two Islands Trust staff and one PSA staff to assist CAOHC and undertake work such as writing documents, trustee and senior staff surveys, job profile updates, advertisements, assist with undertaking screening, assist with development and conducting interview questions, making an offer, assisting with development of performance measures, and coordinating meetings of the CAOHC.

Option 2: Hire an Executive Search Firm

Benefits: Removes the work from Provincial and Islands Trust staff, and provides a different perspective on available CAOs. There is an ability to leverage experience in searching for CAOs to the advantage of the Islands Trust, and ability to tailor that to the its unique mandate, challenges and operating conditions. Search firms often know who is out there and their skillsets and able to recommend those that appear to be a good fit for what the organisation is looking for.

Risks: There is a risk that the process may not meet provincial public service requirements. The RFP requires that recruiting follows the *Public Service Act* and meets the requirements of the merit commissioner. The PSA has advised that it will work with the CAOHC at all steps along the way in hiring the new CAO.

There is a risk that the cost of hiring a firm is more than anticipated. The \$75,000 is based on past experiences in hiring a CAO, advice from the Public Service Agency, and the expected current going rate for an executive search firm, generally between 25% and 35% of the hiring salary for a CAO.

There is a risk that a CAO search firm would not meet the timeline to have a new CAO in place before the departure of the incumbent CAO. The CAOHC has considered this and is working on a process to hire an interim CAO to bridge the gap.

Financial Implications: Search firms charge either hourly, or on delivery a fee based on the starting salary of the hired Executive. This fee is usually between 25% and 35%, which for this position would be between \$45,000 and \$70,000.

Resource Requirements: One Islands Trust Staff to assist with meeting preparation and operation for the CAOHC, and one PSA staff member to provide advice as required. All other work is expected to be undertaken by the firm.

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS: *(What related factors have been identified that are important to the success of completing this work/initiative? Which of these factors are considered critical to the success of this initiative? Discuss outcomes if critical success factors are not met.)*

Comprehensive and accurate job description: Developing a well-drafted and up-to-date job description that clearly outlines the required education, skills, and qualifications is crucial for attracting suitable candidates during the hiring process. A precise job description ensures that the right talent pool is targeted, increasing the chances of finding qualified individuals who can contribute effectively the Islands Trust.

Rigorous and well-executed hiring process: Conducting a thorough and meticulous hiring process is essential to secure a high-quality CAO. This process should include robust screening, interviewing, and evaluation techniques to assess candidates' suitability and compatibility with the position and organizational requirements. A well-executed hiring process enhances the likelihood of finding competent individuals who can make significant contributions to the Islands Trust, and lead the organisation into the future.

Comprehensive orientation and on-boarding: Providing a comprehensive orientation program for the newly hired staff is crucial for enabling them to perform their duties effectively and contribute to the organization's success. Proper on-boarding ensures that the CAO is equipped with the necessary knowledge, resources, and support to navigate their roles and responsibilities.

Support from elected officials and management: The CAO is directly hired by Trust Council. Therefore, gaining support from Islands Trust elected officials is vital to secure ensure that the skillsets of the hired CAO fit with the requirement of Trust Council.

RECOMMENDED OPTION: *(State your recommendation, referencing the options discussed earlier, and summarise why you chose it over others.)*

Option 2: Hire an executive search firm to assist the CAOHC and Trust Council in hiring a new Chief Administrative Officer.

The benefits of this option, listed above, far outweigh the disadvantages and risks.

COST/BENEFIT ANALYSIS: *(Discuss both quantitative and qualitative considerations of this initiative. Quantitative discussion should include financial costs as well as benefits (savings). Qualitative considerations include non-quantifiable costs and benefits.)*

Quantitative Discussion:

The cost is estimated at \$45,000 to \$70,000 for a consultant, plus another \$5,000 contingency. This will be offset in a minor way by requiring less staff resources to support the CAOHC. However, the cost is higher than the alternative.

Qualitative Discussion:

The recommended approach would be using a tried and true and experienced firm, so results are more certain than if the hiring was undertaken in-house. Time is off the essence given the departure date of the incumbent CAO, and a search firm is able to respond quickly given their experience and knowledge of the market. As this is the only political appointed employee of Trust Council, reducing staff involvement in the process reduces any perceived influence in Trust Council's final decision.

PURCHASING PROCEDURE: *(Describe any purchasing processes that will be needed to support this initiative (ie. Direct Award, RFP, ITQ to qualified vendor) if goods or services need to be procured for the work. If this is for new staff hiring, indicate likely hiring method (ie: external competition, government-restricted internal competition, etc.)*

The process will follow the standard Islands Trust procurement process as established by Trust Council Procurement Policy.

PROPOSED IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY: *(What are the specific features of the “roll-out” of the recommended solution? What is the timeline and anticipated date of completion for this initiative?)*

The CAOHC will review the bids resulting from the RFP, and recommend a consultant firm for Trust Council’s ratification. The CAOHC will then work with the firm, and consult with Trust Council.

STAFF RESOURCING: *(What staff resources will be needed to achieve success on this initiative? Estimate how many hours of staff time will be required, by staff level/role. Comment on the reasonability of expected staff hours when assessed in conjunction with other work underway or planned.)*

With the recommended option, staff resource requirements are as follows:

1. Assisting CAOHC in evaluating submissions from Executive Search firms – two staff and 30 hours
2. Writing and executing contract – two staff and 7 hours
3. Assisting CAOHC with meetings – estimated to be one meeting every two weeks April to July – one staff and 50 hours
4. Management of executive search firm contract – 10 hours

Total estimated staff hours = 97 hours

Work is manageable and mostly would be undertaken by Executive Coordinator – other work may need to be shifted to other staff positions, or delayed. Additional support as needed by the Director, Legislative Services; this is expected to mostly involve assisting with evaluation and then writing and execution of a contract, and then management of the contract with an Executive Search Firm.

CHANGE MANAGEMENT/COMMUNICATIONS/COLLABORATION: *(Discuss proposed change management requirements, communications needed, involvement with others. Are there any concerns related to these? If so, how will these be addressed? Have other stakeholders been identified?)*

The CAOHC will communicate with Trust Council and management at all steps along the way, and part of the RFP is for the firm to develop a strategy for seeking input from Trust Council and management.

Requested by (Committee or Business unit): Chief Administrative Officer Hiring Committee (CAOHC)

Prepared by (name, title)/date: David Marlор, Director, Legislative Services/February 21, 2024

Reviewed by (name, title)/date: Members of the CAOHC/February 21, 2024